ORIGINAL

EDWARD H. KUBO, JR. 2499 United States Attorney District of Hawaii

THOMAS A. HELPER 5676
Assistant U.S. Attorney
Room 6-100, PJKK Federal Building
300 Ala Moana Blvd.

Honolulu, Hawaii 96850-6100 Telephone: (808) 541-2850 Facsimile: (808) 541-3752 E-mail: tom.helper@usdoj.gov

Attorneys for Defendant

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CHANNAL

JAN 2 3 2007 A-Y

at So'clock and & Min. L.

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF HAWAII

LUCAS BRUNO III, CHRISTOPHER) CIVIL NO. 03-00567 JMS BMK GAHR, FRANK ROBERT PAULSON, CHARLES TURNER, and TOM DEFENDANT'S DESIGNATION OF YOUNG, DEPOSITION TRANSCRIPT RE: FILBERT CARVALHO; CERTIFICATE Plaintiffs, OF SERVICE VS. MICHAEL CHERTOFF, Secretary,) Trial: February 13, 2007 DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND Hon. J. Michael Judge: SECURITY. Seabright Defendant.

DEFENDANT'S DESIGNATION OF DEPOSITION TRANSCRIPT RE: FILBERT CARVALHO

Now comes defendant and hereby designates the following portions of the deposition transcript of Filbert Carvalho.

Carvalho died in a motorcycle accident in the summer of 2006, and so is not available to testify in this matter.

Carvalho Deposition

4:16-5:11

16:17-17:13

18:10-13

18:18-19

19:3-13

20:21-25

21:12-22:7

23:13-24:23

49:6-10 Defendant will seek to display the relevant portion of Exhibit 100, which is the Exhibit 1 quoted in this portion of Carvalho's testimony, and in the next three excerpts designated immediately below.

50:1-20

70:12-71:2

71:12-72:5

79:21-25

103:3-104:21. Defendant will seek to display Exhibit 106, which is the Exhibit 5 referred to in this portion of Carvalho's testimony.

105:21-107:15. Defendant will seek to display Exhibit 107, which is the Exhibit 6 referred to in this portion of Carvalho's testimony.

107:23-108:16

119:2-25

DATED: January 23, 2007, at Honolulu, Hawaii.

EDWARD H. KUBO, JR. United States Attorney District of Hawaii.

By

THOMAS A. HELPER
Assistant U.S. Attorney

Attorneys for Defendant

* 1	
1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE DISTRICT OF HAWAII
3	TON THE DISTRICT OF HAWAIT
4))
5	LUCAS BRUNO III, CHRISTOPHER) CIVIL NO. 03-00567 DAE/BMK GAHR, FRANK ROBERT PAULSON,) CHARLES TURNER, and Tom Young,)
7) Plaintiffs,)
8) Vs.)
9	MICHAEL CHERTOFF, Secretary,
10	DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND) SECURITY,)
11	Defendant.)
12	
13	DEPOSTRICUL MORTONE DV. MTGMTP.
14	DEPOSITION NOTICED BY: MICHAEL JAY GREEN, ESQ.
15	DEPOSITION OF FILBERT CARVALHO
16	Taken on behalf of the Plaintiffs at TSA Maui County
17	Airports Training Center, 33 Lono Avenue, Suite 270,
18	Kahului, Maui, Hawaii, commencing at 8:54 a.m., May 12, 2006
19	pursuant to Notice.
20	
21	THIS TRANSCRIPT IS WORK PRODUCT, DISTRIBUTION OF
22	BUPLIENTES IS NOT AUTHORIZED.
23	
24	REPORTED BY: GLORIA T. BEDIAMOL, CSR/RPR #262
25	
	20.32



Pursuant to Rule 14 of the Rules Governing Court Reporting in Hawaii, the Reporter's Disclosure was made and is attached hereto.

Pursuant to Rule 30(b)(4) of the Hawaii Rules of Civil Procedure, the following is stated for the record:

My name is Gloria Bediamol, Certified Shorthand Reporter with Iwado Court Reporters, Inc. My business address is 2233 Vineyard Street, Suite A, Wailuku, Maui, Hawaii. Today's date is May 12, 2006. The time is 8:54 a.m. This deposition is taking place at Iwado Court Reporters.

In attendance are: Mr. Green, Ms. Kagawa, Ms. Hevicon and Mr. Helper.

The deponent is:

FILBERT CARVALHO,

The deponent, having been sworn to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, was examined and testified as follows:

EXAMINATION

BY MR. GREEN:

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. Say your name, please.
- A. Filbert W. Carvalho, Jr.
- Q. What's your present business or profession?
- A. I work for The Department of Homeland Security,
 TSA, assigned to the Kahului Airport Maui, I'm an inspection

Another employee for who?

25

Q.

- Q. (By Mr. Green) If you make substantive changes, a judge or jury may know you said "yes" today, and you changed it to "no"; okay?

 A. Yes, sir.

 Q. Obviously, the questions that are asked, the answers will be given under penalty of perjury, and I know that you are aware of that, yes?
 - A. Yes, sir.

- Q. Anything -- this is the only opportunity you actually get to ask me anything in a deposition, unless it's for clarification. Is there anything you want to ask me before we begin this thing?
 - A. No.
- Q. You are not on any medication that would impair your ability to understand questions?
 - A. No.
- Q. How far did you go in school? I think you may have mentioned this, but after high school how far did you go?
 - A. Some college.
- Q. When did you end your college career? What year was it?
- A. I'm still attending. I ended in '93 and went back briefly.
 - Q. Good for you. What are you studying?

ł	1
1	A. Criminal science.
2	Q. Your first employment, and I don't care about
3	working part time, but your first real employment, in your
4	mind, would have been what? Either during college or after
5	high school, what would it have been?
6	A. U.S. Army.
7	Q. When was that?
8	A. 1985 to 1993 February 14th.
9	Q. Where did you serve?
10	A. Europe, Central American, North Carolina, Georgia
11	and back home to Hawaii.
12	Q. And you were with the army?
13	A. Yes, sir.
14	Q. Did you ever work for the MPs?
15	A. Yes, sir.
16	Q. And when was that?
17	A. 1988, '89 Ford Meade, Maryland.
18	Q. Arrested people from time to time?
19	A. Yes, sir.
20	Q. Got some training in report writing?
21	A. Yes, sir.
22	Q. In those days, were you trained to at least, when
23	you make reports, try to put down things you thought were
24	the most important?
25	A. Yes, sir.

**	
1	Q. Obviously, you can't write everything down; so
2	that's why you would at least try to write down the most
3	important parts of the report, yes?
4	A. Yes, sir.
5	Q. And probably in the army a hundred or more reports
6	as an MP?
7	A. Not that much, sir.
8	Q. Fifty?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Okay. After the army, where did you go?
11	A. Department of Public Safety, State of Hawaii.
12	Q. What years were they?
13	A. '94 through '96.
14	Q. Who was your supervisor there?
15	A. George Sumner (phonetic).
16	Q. Did you work with Faith Evans?
17	A. Yes.
18	Q. What was your position in public safety?
19	A. I was a corrections officer then became a sheriff.
20	Q. Lots of reports, right?
21	A. Yes, sir.
22	Q. Important again to make sure you write down the
23	things you believe are important, yes?
24	A. Yes, sir.
25	Q. Sign your name to report, you are attesting that

```
it's true and accurate to the best of your knowledge?
  2
           A.
                Yes, sir.
  3
                What do you do next? Strike that. What year do
           0.
  4
     you leave public safety/sheriff?
  5
                '96 to 2000 I transferred from public safety to
     DLNR. I became a Department of Conservation enforcement
  6
  7
     officer.
  8
                You've been in law enforcement how many years, if
           0.
     we include what you do now, how many years have you been in
  9
10
     it?
11
          Α.
                From 1985 to the present, sir.
12
                So 22 years or so?
          0.
13
          Α.
                Yes, sir.
14
                Over those years, have you had occasion to
          Q.
15
     investigate various forms of misconduct?
16
          Α.
               Yes, sir.
17
               Various forms of criminal violations?
          0.
18
          Α.
               Yes, sir.
19
               I'm assuming over those years you've investigated
          0.
20
     allegations of discrimination of various kinds?
21
          A.
               Yes.
22
               Violations of people's civil rights?
          Q.
23
          Α.
               Yes, sir.
24
               Might include over the years age discrimination?
          \mathbb{Q}_*
25
          A.
               Just recently, yes, sir.
```

1 Sexual harassment? Q. 2 Α. Yes, sir. 3 0. Sex discrimination? 4 A. Yes. 5 0. Race discrimination? 6 Α. Yes. 7 You kind of know it -- after all these years, you Q. kind of know it when you hear it; right? 8 9 Α. Yes. 10 MR. HELPER: I move to strike that last question 11 as vaque. 12 (By Mr. Green) He understood it, Tom, and he 13 answered it. If you don't understand it, just tell me; okay? 14 I'll tell you something, Brother, there's no tricks in this 15 deposition. You have a very good lawyer, so if he makes an 16 objection, stop speaking, and then if he tells you not to 17 answer, then you should ignore him and just answer. But if 18 he tells you not to answer, don't answer and then we'll move 19 20 on to something else. 21 When do you start at Wackenhut, if you did? 22 you ever work for Wackenhut? 23 Α. Yes. 24 0. When was that? 25 Α. Briefly in 2000.

1	Q. And "briefly" means when?	
2	A. Like three days.	
3	Q. What was the reason you went there?	
4	A. I went there as a law enforcement officer	
5	part-time work.	
6	Q. Did you work for Buzzy?	
7	A. Yes.	
8	Q. Do you know Godfrey Ortiz?	
9	A. No.	
10	Q. Kenny Chang?	
11	A. Yes.	
12	Q. So you are there three days, then where do you go?	
13	A. I got a called from the federal air marshal	
14	branch, and it was right after 911.	
15	Q. What did you do?	
16	A. I became a federal air marshal.	
17	Q. You flew around?	
18	A. Yes.	
19	Q. What happens after that?	
20	A. I was assigned in Los Angeles, I had the	
21	opportunity to return home to Maui, and the inspections	
22	division opened up, and I transferred as an inspector to	
23	Kahului airport.	
24	Q. What exactly is your definition of "inspections	
25	division"?	

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. You never had, and just correct me, it's kind of a negative question, but I assume during your training you knew never to ignore claims of discrimination; is that right? In other words, if you believe if you were told that someone had been discriminated against, you would not simply walk away and ignore it if your job description was to investigate those kinds of things; right?
- A. My job description is not to investigate those. I am a security investigator inspector.
- Q. When you were with Wackenhut even for those days or working for TSA, was it your impression that if you were told about some type of discrimination, racial or otherwise, that you could simply ignore it and not report it to someone

1	else?
2	A. No, sir.
3	Q. What did you believe your job would be in that
4	regard?
5	A. Even ethically, as an employee of the federal
6	government, we're trained to report.
7	Q. Did you get any training when you went to work
8	for, I'm just going to use TSA, whether you were actually an
9	employee for them, did you have any training?
10	A. Yes, sir.
11	Q. What was the training?
12	A. With reference to?
13	Q. What kind of training about anything you got from
	1 wing 10 w 900 Llott
14	TSA?
14 15	
	TSA?
15	TSA? A. I was trained
15 16	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry.
15 16 17	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening?
15 16 17 18	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening? Q. What happens when I go through the
15 16 17 18	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening? Q. What happens when I go through the A. I was never a screener. I was always an
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening? Q. What happens when I go through the A. I was never a screener. I was always an inspector. I assisted with the roll-out. It's a different
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening? Q. What happens when I go through the A. I was never a screener. I was always an inspector. I assisted with the roll-out. It's a different branch. I don't know
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	A. I was trained Q. In the screening area, I'm sorry. A. In screening? Q. What happens when I go through the A. I was never a screener. I was always an inspector. I assisted with the roll-out. It's a different branch. I don't know Q. What was your job as an inspector?

regarding those regulations?

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

- A. I went to initially four months, then two and a half months of training in an academy that taught us how to read the CFR, which is the Code of Federal Regulations, and who had to abide by each of those sections: the air carrier, the airport operator, and us the federal government.
- Q. Then when you came back here to Maui, did you get any additional training for your position?
 - A. No, sir.
- Q. Your immediate supervisor would have been here on Maui?
 - A. At that time, Lowery Leong.
 - Q. And after that?
 - A. Howard Tagamori.
 - Q. When Howard came in, what was Lowery's position?
 - A. Lowery is the federal security director.
 - Q. Do they have offices at the airport?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. You have offices at the airport?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. What's your ethnic background?
 - A. I'm Portuguese/Hawaiian.
- Q. Did you instruct any of the people who work for TSA in how to write reports?

A. Yes, sir.

- Q. This is October 17, 2002. It says it's from you, special agent/acting screening manager through Howard Tagamori to Lowery Leong. Do you remember this?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Regarding MSF supervisor, Christopher Gahr. When you just look at this for a moment, it says on the second page at the bottom that this statement was prepared by you on October 17, '02. Do you see that?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Was this something that when you look at this, the date that it was prepared, did you have some bullet points that you refreshed your memory from an earlier report, or was this report prepared in its entirety on this date? Do you understand the question?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Do you know whether you had some notes or some bullet points and then later on, some other day, sat down and prepared this report?
 - A. Yes, sir.
 - Q. What happened?
- A. Probably out of the manager's log, bullet points, or some notes.
 - Q. Where would the manager's log be?
 - A. At the checkpoint.

- Q. And so what would be the circumstances that you would have gathered this information to make this report?
- A. I believe it was a complaint about -- there was a complaint about him opening up the checkpoint, and then there was a run-in that I had with him when I asked him, through the FSD, asked him to relieve a --
 - Q. What does that mean, FSD?
- A. Federal Security Director Lowery Leong. When the FSD walked by, he saw a screener with her hand bandaged, and she was basically patting down and hand-wanding people. And because of limited use of her hand and no dexterity, no feeling, and the public -- we didn't want the public to think that they are being patted down by somebody who was injured that couldn't feel them --
- $\ensuremath{\mathbb{Q}}$. You really lost me with that. You did not want the public --
- A. If you were going through the airport, sir, and I alarmed, and I had this big bandage on the hand, and you knew I couldn't feel anything, and for security reasons, she had no dexterity in her hands --
- Q. You know, I heard everything you said, because I know you are speaking English, but I didn't understand any of it. Is there some regulation about that, about having dexterity in both hands?
 - A. You have to be able to pat down and feel an item

getting people in trouble. That's really what it's about, right? Right?

- A. No. Like I said, if we could handle it at a local level, that's what we wanted to do. Our supervisors handled it.
- Q. That appears not to have been Mr. Gahr's style. This guy is writing down everything, and it looks like he is going to go out of state to Washington to report all kinds of people. At least that's the sense of this black book, right?
 - A. Yes.

Q. "At 1935 hours after interviewing Harlan, Russell, I went to the checkpoint. I observed Greenisen, Theresa performing her duties with a bandaged left hand. I relieved her of her post as I found that she had two dislocated fingers. The bandage and splints along with medical tape on the left ring and middle finger did not allow for movement or dexterity. I brought this to the attention of Gahr, Christopher, MSF/SPV, who then became very challenging and insubordinate."

What was the challenging and insubordination?

- A. He refused to replace her. He says, I'll take the bandage off of her hand, dah, dah, dah, she can stay here.
 - Q. I got no idea what the "dah, dah, dah" means.
 - A. He said, "Just leave her in place. It's okay."

A. So I wanted her off the site. I wanted to know why, and he wouldn't hear of it. I said, "Listen, she needs a doctor's note to return to work. She can't just take it off, now that we know the injury was there.

22

23

24

1	Q. Did you report this in a writing that went into
2	Mr. Gahr's file, the fact that he had somebody there with a
3	bandaged left hand and dislocated fingers?
4	A. And that he refused to remove her? I believe so,
5	yes, sir.
6	Q. And I want to know, did you put anything in
7	Patty's files regarding discriminatory remarks ever?
8	A. I'm not sure if any of the other managers did, but
9	I believe she does have something in
10	Q. You just lost me. You're too good of an officer.
11	Didn't you understand the question?
12	A. I didn't
13	Q. Read it back, please.
14	A. I didn't, no.
15	Q. Let's take a break.
16	(A recess was taken.)
17	Q. (By Mr. Green) Let's go back to Exhibit 1 and I
18	just want to go down to the last paragraph on page 1 of your
19	report. "Christopher Gahr asked to speak with me at 2115
20	hours regarding security issues." Did that happen?
21	A. Yes, sir.
22	Q. "I had him relieved by another MSF supervisor and
23	asked him to meet me in the TSA office." Did that happen?
24	A. Yes, sir.
25	Q. Who was present besides you and Gahr?

first name is, I guess. 1 2 We were told by them that they knew we were calling Washington and we were told specifically by him that 3 if he ever caught us calling Washington, if he found who it 4 5 was, that he would terminate us and take care of." 6 Did I read that correctly? 7 Α. Yes, sir. 8 Q. You have no memory of this happening? 9 That's because it didn't happen, sir. A. 10 Q. This is a false statement under oath, right? 11 Α. I didn't say any of this. 12 0. Was it ever said in front of you by anyone else? 13 Α. No. sir. 14 Q. Never heard it? 15 Α. No. 16 Never heard Patty Igarashi, I guess, ever say Q. "fucking haole" to anybody, right? 17 Α.

No, sir.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q., Give me the October 18, '02 letter, the Chris Gahr letter.

Do you know when Chris Gahr was terminated?

- Α. Not the exact date.
- On October 25, '02 is the date we have, and it may Q. or may not be correct, yes?
 - Α. Yes.

```
Did you ever tell him you would do that?
1
          0.
 2
               No, sir.
          Α.
 3
               Give me the e-mails please, October 20, 4:32 p.m.
          Q.
              (Deposition Exhibit 5 was marked for identification.)
 4
               You see where it says 4:32 p.m.? do you have the
 5
 6
    time?
 7
               Yes.
          Α.
               It's from Chris Gahr sent Sunday, October 20,
 8
     2002, 4:32 p.m. to you. Do you remember getting this?
 9
10
               Yes, sir.
          Α.
               Do you remember reading it?
11
12
          Α.
               Yes, sir.
               It says, "Filbert Carvalho: The letter requesting
13
          O.
     that I go back on MSF is in the next E-mail."
14
15
               Do you know what he is referring to?
16
               Yes, sir.
          Α.
17
               What is he referring to?
               He was going to e-mail headquarters and tell them
18
          Α.
19
     that he wanted to go back on the road and not drop at Maui.
20
          0.
               He wanted to leave Maui, right?
21
               Yes, sir.
          Α.
22
               Leave the airport, right?
          0.
23
          Α.
               Yes, sir.
24
               "In accordance with our agreement, I trust that
25
    the statement against me will be destroyed. Christopher
```

1 Gahr." 2 Was there an agreement? 3 Α. No, sir. Tell me, when you read this, did you respond and 4 0. 5 say, "What are you talking about?"? 6 I immediately printed it, took it to the FSD, who was present during the meeting, when he tried to get me to 7 8 sign something on a legal pad stating that I'd throw away 9 the documents against him. 10 I'm missing something. Did you ever respond to 0. 11 him and say, "What are you talking about? We had no 12 agreement"? I was told not to. 13 Α. By whom? 14 15 Beth Anderson our legal at that time. Α. 16 0. She told you not to respond to this? Yes, sir. 17 Α. So it stood the way it was, "I trust that the 18 19 statement against me will be destroyed"? 20 I was not, nor was the FSD, in the capacity to 21 destroy any of the write-ups over a deal to relocate. 22 If you don't understand the question, just tell 23 I just asked you whether or not you ever responded to 24 this.

No. I didn't know it was a "yes" or a "no."

	,	
1	Q.	Do you want her to read back the answer you gave
2	me to the	question?
3		MR. HELPER: There's no question. Let's take two
4	minutes o	ff the record.
5		(There was a discussion off the record.)
6	Ω.	One of the things that you told me earlier was
7	that Chris	s Gahr was not terminated on Maui, right?
8	Α.	Yes, sir.
9	Q.	He was terminated where? What are you reading?
10	А.	His receiving station in Oakland.
11	Q.	Did you attempt to have him terminated in Oakland?
12	А.	No, sir, the way it worked was
13	Ω.	Listen to the question. The question was whether
14	you attemp	oted to have him terminated in Oakland?
15	Α.	No.
16	Ω.	Did you take any steps to get him terminated in
17	Oakland?	
18	Α.	No.
19	Q.	Mark this as next, please.
20		(Deposition Exhibit 6 was marked for identification.)
21		This is dated October 21, 2002. Is that the right
22	date?	
23	Α.	Yes.
24	Ω.	And it's from you to Lisa Baker, TSA Employee
25	Relations	?

1	A. Uh-hm.
2	Q. Where does she work?
3	A. She was like our legal prior to Marty. She took
4	care of all of our employee stuff before we were assigned an
5	attorney.
6	Q. Where are her offices, if you know?
7	A. California somewhere, sir.
8	Q. Do you remember drafting this memo?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Regarding who?
11	A. Chris Gahr.
12	Q. "This memo is regarding Mobile Screening Force
13	Supervisor Christopher Gahr, whose performance has been
14	problematic on numerous occasions."
15	A. Yes.
16	Q. What was the problematic things on numerous
17	occasions?
18	A. There was an attachment that went with this that
19	listed the things that he did wrong.
20	Q. And the things that were listed, which I'll show
21	you, where did you get that information from?
22	A. From manager's logs an counseling from, I believe,
23	Pat Collins. Right now, that's all I remember, from Pat
24	Collins.
25	${\mathbb Q}$. And the reason you were writing this document to
	II

emails sent to me from Mr. Gahr. "It behooves me" -- I'm reading from paragraph 3. 2 "It behooves me to report that the decision has been made to 3 relieve Mr. Gahr from future employment obligations. 4 Effective immediately, we will no longer employ him here at 5 Kahului International Airport." 6 7 Did I read that correctly? 8 Α. Yes. "Mr. Gahr has contacted MSF operations and has 9 been scheduled for deployment in Oakland, California. I 10 would like you to review the attached statements and seek 11 grounds for removal." 12 13 Do you see that? 14 Α. Yes, sir. 15 Ο. Removal from what? From the TSA and MSF. 16 Α. 17 0. Where? From being on the MSF. 18 Α. 19 In Oakland, California? Q. 20 No. removal from TSA and from the MSF. Α. 21 "His constant failure to perform to instructions Q. 22 and SOP, along with his insubordination has caused 23 inefficiency at our checkpoint." 24 Do you see that?

25

Α.

Yes.

1	A. I'm not sure of the exact date.
2	Q. Going back to the October 21, 2002 to/from to Lisa
3	Baker, tell me about your discussions with Lowery Leong that
4	you reference in here?
5	MS. KAGAWA: It's a memo to Lisa Baker.
6	THE WITNESS: Exhibit 6?
7	Q. (By Mr. Green) You said you prepared this under
8	the direction of Lowery Leong, right?
9	A. Yes.
10	Q. Tell me what it was, the circumstances of your
11	conversation where he told you to prepare this?
12	A. Basically, he looked at the write-ups, he looked
13	at the manager's log and everything, and he just told me to
14	prepare a document, send it to legal and see if we can have
15	him removed.
16	Q. Where did the conversation take place?
17	A. Downstairs TSA office.
18	Q. Who was present?
19	A. I'm not sure.
20	Q. What did Mr. Leong say to you, as best you can
21	recall?
22	A. Basically, take whatever I had documented and
23	forward it to Lisa Baker.
24	Q. Take whatever who had documented?
25	A. Whatever Patrick had documented against Chris.

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF HAWAII

LUCAS BRUNO III, CHRISTOPHER) CIVIL NO. 03-00567 JMS BMK GAHR, FRANK ROBERT PAULSON,) CHARLES TURNER, and TOM YOUNG,

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Plaintiffs,

VS.

MICHAEL CHERTOFF, Secretary, DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY,

Defendant.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY that, on the date and by the method of service noted below, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served on the following at their last known address:

Served by First-Class Mail and E-mail

Christopher Gahr 700 E Washington, #81 Colton, CA 92324

January 23, 2007

chrisgahr@aol.com

Plaintiff Pro Se

DATED: January 23, 2007, at Honolulu, Hawaii.

Coleen Fasaka-Shoda